

Islamic Approach to Education Balancing Religious and Secular Knowledge in Pakistani Schools

Dr. Muhammad Imran

Assistant Professor, Imperial college of Business Studies, Lahore.

Email: Imran555@gmail.com

Dr. Ghulam Mustafa Anjum

Assistant Professor, Imperial college of Business Studies, Lahore.

Email: abuhuzefa5@gmail.com

Dr. Javed Iqbal

Assistant Professor, Imperial college of Business Studies, Lahore.

Email: dr.javed1234@gmail.com

Dr. Zafar Ali

Assistant Professor, Imperial college of Business Studies, Lahore.

Email: zafarabasi786@gmail.com

Received on: 08-01-2024

Accepted on: 10-02-2024

Abstract

The Islamic approach to education emphasizes a holistic integration of religious and secular knowledge, aiming to cultivate well-rounded individuals who are morally upright and intellectually capable. In Pakistan, this approach has been pivotal in shaping educational policies and curricula, but the challenge remains in achieving a balanced curriculum that effectively combines both aspects. This article explores the historical and philosophical foundations of Islamic education, highlighting the principles that guide the integration of religious and secular knowledge. It examines the current educational landscape in Pakistan, where religious education often dominates in madrassas, while secular subjects are prioritized in public and private schools. The article argues for a more integrated curriculum that aligns with Islamic values while addressing the demands of modern society. It proposes practical strategies for achieving this balance, including curriculum reforms, teacher training, and community involvement. By aligning religious teachings with contemporary knowledge, Pakistani schools can produce students who are not only spiritually grounded but also equipped to contribute meaningfully to society. The discussion also addresses the challenges and potential resistance to such integration, offering insights into how these can be mitigated. Ultimately, the article advocates for an educational model that fosters intellectual growth, moral development, and societal progress, rooted in Islamic principles.

Keywords: Islamic education, curriculum integration, religious knowledge, secular knowledge, Pakistani schools.

Introduction

Education in Islam is not merely the pursuit of knowledge but a comprehensive process of nurturing individuals to fulfill their role as responsible and ethical members of society. The Islamic approach to education emphasizes the harmonious integration of both religious and secular knowledge, reflecting the holistic nature of the faith itself. This dual focus has profound implications for educational systems, particularly in a country like Pakistan, where Islamic values deeply influence social, cultural, and political life.

In Pakistan, the question of balancing religious and secular education has been central to educational policy debates since the country's inception. The founders envisioned a system that would preserve Islamic identity while also equipping citizens with the skills and knowledge necessary for participation in a modern, globalized world. However, this vision has faced numerous challenges, from ideological conflicts to disparities in educational quality across different institutions.¹

This article explores the Islamic perspective on education, highlighting the principles that guide the integration of religious and secular knowledge. It examines the historical evolution of educational practices in Pakistan, the current state of the educational system, and the challenges and opportunities in achieving a balanced approach. By delving into these aspects, the article aims to provide a nuanced understanding of how Pakistan can develop an education system that is both rooted in Islamic tradition and responsive to the demands of the modern world.

The Islamic Perspective on Education

In Islam, education holds a position of paramount importance. The Qur'an and Hadith emphasize the pursuit of knowledge as a duty for every Muslim, reflecting the belief that education is not merely a privilege but a religious obligation. The Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) famously stated, "Seeking knowledge is an obligation upon every Muslim"²

This emphasis underscores that education is essential for spiritual, intellectual, and moral development, laying the foundation for a balanced life.

Religious and Secular Knowledge Integration

Islamic education is traditionally divided into two categories: religious (ulum al-din) and secular (ulum al-dunya) knowledge. Religious knowledge encompasses the study of the Qur'an, Hadith, Fiqh (Islamic jurisprudence), and other areas central to understanding Islamic teachings. Secular knowledge, on the other hand, includes fields like science, mathematics, history, and literature, which are vital for the worldly life.³

In Islam, these two forms of knowledge are not seen as mutually exclusive. Instead, they are complementary, creating a holistic approach to education. Religious knowledge provides the moral and ethical framework, guiding individuals on how to live a life pleasing to Allah. Secular knowledge, when pursued with the right intention, is also considered an act of worship (ibadah). The Qur'an encourages Muslims to reflect on the natural world and to seek understanding of its signs (Ayat) as a means to strengthen faith and contribute to the welfare of society.⁴

The Historical Context of Education in Islamic Civilization

Historically, Islamic civilization exemplified this integration. During the Golden Age of Islam (8th to 14th century), centers of learning such as Al-Qarawiyyin, Al-Azhar, and the House of Wisdom (Bayt al-Hikmah) in Baghdad were renowned for their pursuit of both religious and secular sciences. Scholars like Al-Ghazali, Ibn Sina, and Al-Farabi demonstrated how Islamic teachings could harmonize with philosophy, medicine, and other sciences.⁵

Contemporary Relevance

In the contemporary context, particularly in Pakistan, this balance remains crucial. The challenge lies in integrating Islamic values with modern education, ensuring that students are equipped with both the ethical grounding from religious teachings and the skills needed to thrive in a globalized world. Schools and madrasas must collaborate to provide a curriculum that does not compromise on religious teachings while fostering critical thinking, creativity, and scientific inquiry. This approach will help produce well-rounded individuals who can contribute positively to society while adhering to Islamic principles.

The historical context of education in Islamic civilization is rich and deeply rooted in the Islamic tradition, which emphasizes the pursuit of knowledge as a religious obligation. Education in Islamic history has always been a comprehensive endeavor, integrating both religious and secular knowledge. This holistic approach stems from the Islamic worldview, which does not dichotomize the sacred and the secular, but rather sees all knowledge as interconnected and valuable in understanding and living a life that pleases God.

Early Islamic Period

During the early Islamic period, education was primarily centered on religious teachings, with the Qur'an and Hadith serving as the core subjects of study.⁶

The mosque was the primary center of learning, where scholars and students gathered to study not only religious texts but also subjects such as grammar, poetry, rhetoric, and law. The early emphasis on religious education was driven by the need to understand the Qur'an, perform religious duties, and live according to Islamic principles.

The Golden Age of Islamic Civilization

This period saw the flourishing of intellectual pursuits across various fields, including science, medicine, philosophy, mathematics, and the arts. Muslim scholars, inspired by the Qur'anic injunctions to seek knowledge, made significant advancements in these areas. Centers of learning, such as the Bayt al-Hikma (House of Wisdom) in Baghdad, became hubs for the translation of Greek, Persian, and Indian texts into Arabic, which were then studied and expanded upon by Muslim intellectuals.

Prominent figures such as Al-Farabi, Ibn Sina (Avicenna), and Al-Ghazali exemplify the Islamic approach to education during this period. These scholars were not only experts in religious sciences but also made substantial contributions to fields like medicine, philosophy, and astronomy. Their works reflect a deep integration of religious and secular knowledge, demonstrating that the pursuit of knowledge in Islam was comprehensive and inclusive.⁷

The Madrasa System

The development of the madrasa system during the medieval period institutionalized Islamic education.⁸

Madrasas were established across the Muslim world, providing formal education that included both religious sciences (like Fiqh, Tafsir, and Hadith) and secular subjects (like mathematics, astronomy, and logic). The curriculum in these madrasas was designed to produce well-rounded individuals who could serve the community in various capacities, whether as religious scholars, judges, physicians, or administrators.

One of the most famous examples is the Al-Qarawiyyin University in Fez, Morocco, established in 859, which is recognized as one of the oldest existing universities in the world. Similarly, Al-Azhar University in Cairo, founded in 970, became a premier center for Islamic learning, attracting students from all over the Muslim world. These institutions reflected the Islamic commitment to education that combined religious obligations with a broader understanding of the world.

Ottoman Empire and Later Developments

In the Ottoman Empire, the educational system continued to emphasize the integration of religious and secular knowledge.⁹

The empire supported various educational institutions, including madrassas, tekkes (Sufi lodges), and endowments (waqf), which facilitated the spread of both religious and scientific knowledge. The Ottomans also encouraged the study of subjects like medicine, astronomy, and engineering, which were considered essential for the empire's administration and military.¹⁰

The historical context of education in Islamic civilization shows a strong tradition of integrating religious and secular knowledge.¹¹

This approach not only reflected the holistic worldview of Islam but also led to significant contributions in various fields of human knowledge. As Pakistani schools seek to balance religious and secular education today, they can draw inspiration from this rich legacy, which demonstrates that the pursuit of knowledge in Islam encompasses all aspects of life, without creating a divide between the sacred and the worldly.

The current state of education in Pakistan is characterized by significant disparities, challenges, and an ongoing struggle to balance religious and secular knowledge. Pakistan's education system is divided into several streams, including public schools, private schools, madrassas (Islamic seminaries), and non-formal educational institutions. Each of these streams varies significantly in terms of curriculum, quality, and the balance between religious and secular education.

The Current State of Education in Pakistan

Public Schools:

The majority of students in Pakistan attend public schools. These schools follow the national curriculum, which includes both religious and secular subjects.¹²

However, the quality of education in public schools is often hampered by a lack of resources, poorly trained teachers, and inadequate infrastructure. The religious component in public schools is typically limited to Islamic Studies (Islamiyat) classes, which focus on basic Islamic

teachings and rituals.

Private Schools:

Private schools vary widely in terms of quality and curriculum. Elite private schools often emphasize a secular curriculum, preparing students for international examinations like the O and A Levels.¹³

In contrast, other private schools may offer a blend of religious and secular education, with varying degrees of emphasis on each. The religious content in these schools is usually confined to Islamic studies classes, similar to public schools.

Madrassas:

Madrassas focus primarily on religious education, teaching students Islamic theology, jurisprudence, and Quranic studies. While some madrassas have incorporated secular subjects like mathematics and science, the primary emphasis remains on religious instruction.¹⁴

The madrassa system serves a significant portion of the population, particularly in rural and low-income areas, but the lack of secular education limits students' opportunities in the broader job market.

Non-Formal Education:

This includes a range of educational initiatives, often run by NGOs that aim to provide basic literacy and numeracy skills to out-of-school children.¹⁵

These programs may incorporate both religious and secular content, but their reach and impact are limited.

Challenges Facing the Education System

While the integration of religious and secular education is essential, it faces several challenges. These include resistance from conservative elements who fear the dilution of religious education, the politicization of curriculum reforms, and the lack of resources in public schools. Addressing these challenges requires a concerted effort from policymakers, educators, and the broader society.

The way forward involves fostering a culture of education that values both religious and secular knowledge. This can be achieved by promoting dialogue between different educational stakeholders, investing in teacher training, and ensuring that educational policies are implemented effectively. Furthermore, there needs to be an emphasis on critical thinking and ethical reasoning, enabling students to apply their knowledge in ways that benefit both themselves and society.

Quality and Access:

One of the most pressing issues in Pakistan's education system is the disparity in quality between different types of schools.¹⁶

Public schools, which serve the majority of students, often suffer from overcrowded classrooms, outdated teaching methods, and a lack of basic facilities. Access to quality education is also uneven, with rural areas and marginalized communities facing the most significant barriers.

Curriculum Imbalance:

The national curriculum, especially in public schools, has been criticized for not striking the

right balance between religious and secular education.¹⁷

While Islamic Studies is a compulsory subject, it is often taught in isolation from other subjects, leading to a compartmentalized understanding of knowledge. The secular curriculum, on the other hand, may lack integration with religious teachings, creating a dichotomy in students' learning experiences.

Ideological Influence:

Education in Pakistan has historically been influenced by ideological considerations. Successive governments have used the education system to promote specific narratives, often at the expense of a balanced and holistic approach to learning.¹⁸

This has led to the politicization of education and has impacted the quality and content of both religious and secular instruction.

Madrasa Reform:

Efforts to reform the madrasa system to include more secular subjects have faced resistance from religious leaders and institutions.¹⁹

While some progress has been made, the majority of madrassas still operate with a curriculum that is heavily skewed towards religious education, limiting students' prospects outside of religious vocations.

Educational Equity:

There is a significant gap in educational outcomes between different regions, genders, and socioeconomic groups. Girls, particularly in rural areas, face considerable barriers to education, including cultural norms, poverty, and safety concerns.²⁰

This inequality is compounded by the lack of a uniform curriculum across the different educational streams, leading to varying levels of knowledge and skill among students.

The current state of education in Pakistan reflects a complex interplay of historical, social, and political factors. While there is a growing recognition of the need to balance religious and secular education, achieving this balance remains a challenge. The disparities between different educational streams, the quality of education, and the ideological influences on curriculum development all contribute to a fragmented education system. Addressing these challenges requires comprehensive reforms that not only improve access and quality but also integrate religious and secular knowledge in a way that prepares students for the diverse challenges of modern life.

Balancing Religious and Secular Knowledge in Pakistani Schools

Balancing religious and secular knowledge in Pakistani schools is a crucial issue within the broader discourse on education in Pakistan.²¹

This balance is central to shaping the intellectual and moral development of students, ensuring that they receive a well-rounded education that is both relevant to their cultural and religious identity and responsive to the demands of the modern world.

The Importance of Religious Education

In Pakistan, religious education holds significant importance as the majority of the population identifies as Muslim.²²

Religious education, often imparted through the subject of Islamic Studies, aims to instill moral values, a sense of identity, and a connection with Islamic heritage. It includes teachings

from the Quran, Hadith, Islamic history, and principles of Islamic ethics, which are integral to the spiritual and moral development of students.

This focus on religious education is seen as essential for preserving cultural and religious values in a rapidly globalizing world. It helps students develop a sense of belonging and a moral compass guided by Islamic principles. Additionally, religious education is intended to promote social harmony by fostering a shared understanding of ethical conduct and community welfare.

The Role of Secular Education

Secular education, on the other hand, is critical for preparing students to participate in the global economy and address the challenges of the modern world.²³

Subjects such as science, mathematics, languages, and social studies provide students with the knowledge and skills necessary for personal and national development. These subjects are essential for fostering critical thinking, innovation, and economic progress.

In the context of Pakistan, secular education is also vital for addressing issues such as poverty, healthcare, and technological advancement. The knowledge and skills acquired through secular education enable students to contribute to various sectors, including engineering, medicine, law, and business, thereby driving the country's socio-economic development.

Challenges in Balancing the Two

Balancing religious and secular education in Pakistan's schools is fraught with challenges. One of the primary issues is the ideological divide between proponents of a religious-centric curriculum and advocates of a more secular approach.²⁴

This divide often manifests in the curriculum, with some arguing that an overemphasis on religious education undermines the teaching of critical secular subjects, while others believe that secular education alone cannot address the moral and spiritual needs of students.

Another challenge is the quality and uniformity of education across the country. In many public schools, the curriculum is heavily influenced by religious content, sometimes at the expense of secular subjects. In contrast, private schools, especially those catering to the elite, tend to emphasize secular education, with religious studies playing a secondary role. This disparity can lead to educational inequity and differing worldviews among students from different backgrounds.

Integrative Approaches

To effectively balance religious and secular knowledge, there is a need for an integrative approach that respects the importance of both.²⁵

This could involve revising the curriculum to ensure that religious education does not overshadow secular subjects but rather complements them. For instance, teaching ethical principles through both religious and secular lenses can help students develop a more holistic understanding of morality and ethics.

Moreover, teacher training programs should emphasize the importance of this balance, equipping educators with the skills to deliver both religious and secular content effectively. Schools can also adopt co-curricular activities that promote values common to both streams, such as community service, social justice, and environmental stewardship, thereby bridging

the gap between religious and secular knowledge.

Balancing religious and secular education in Pakistani schools is essential for creating a generation of students who are morally grounded and intellectually capable.²⁶

By integrating these two streams of knowledge, Pakistan can ensure that its students are well-prepared to navigate the complexities of the modern world while remaining true to their cultural and religious heritage.

Challenges and the Way Forward

Balancing religious and secular education in Pakistani schools is a critical and complex issue, with several challenges that need to be addressed to move forward effectively.

Curriculum Integration:

One of the biggest challenges is the integration of religious and secular knowledge into a cohesive curriculum.²⁷

Historically, the curriculum in Pakistan has often been divided into two separate streams: religious education (typically in madrassas) and secular education (in government and private schools). The lack of integration leads to a gap between religious and secular worldviews among students. Madrassa students may have deep religious knowledge but lack skills in science, technology, and modern subjects, while students from secular schools might have little understanding of Islamic teachings.

Standardization and Quality Control:

There is significant disparity in the quality of education provided in different types of schools across Pakistan.²⁸

While some private schools offer a blend of religious and secular education, many public schools struggle with outdated syllabi, lack of resources, and poorly trained teachers. Madrassas, on the other hand, vary widely in their curriculum, with some offering a broad education that includes secular subjects, while others focus solely on religious instruction. Standardizing the curriculum to include both religious and secular subjects, and ensuring quality control across different types of educational institutions, remains a significant challenge.

Teacher Training:

Another key issue is the lack of adequately trained teachers who can effectively deliver a curriculum that integrates both religious and secular knowledge.²⁹

Teachers in secular schools often lack the necessary religious education to teach Islamic studies effectively, while madrassa teachers may not have the qualifications to teach secular subjects like science or mathematics. Addressing this requires comprehensive teacher training programs that equip educators with the skills to teach both aspects of the curriculum.

Resistance to Change:

Cultural and ideological resistance is a significant barrier. There are segments of society that view secular education as a threat to religious values, while others see religious education as an impediment to modernization and progress.³⁰

Balancing these opposing views requires careful consideration and the promotion of a model that emphasizes the compatibility of religious teachings with modern knowledge.

Policy and Implementation Gaps:

Despite efforts to introduce reforms, there are significant gaps in policy implementation. For

instance, the Single National Curriculum (SNC) aims to reduce disparities between different educational systems by standardizing the curriculum across the country.³¹

However, its implementation faces challenges due to regional disparities, lack of resources, and resistance from various stakeholders.

Integrated Curriculum Development:

Developing an integrated curriculum that combines Islamic teachings with modern subjects is essential.³²

This curriculum should emphasize the compatibility of Islamic values with scientific and technological advancements. For example, Islamic principles of ethics and justice can be taught alongside subjects like economics and social studies, illustrating their relevance in contemporary society.

Teacher Training and Development:

Comprehensive teacher training programs should be established to ensure that educators are equipped to teach both religious and secular subjects effectively.³³

This could include specialized training for madrasa teachers in modern subjects and for secular school teachers in Islamic studies.

Community Engagement and Awareness:

Engaging communities and building awareness about the importance of balancing religious and secular education is crucial. Educational reforms should be accompanied by dialogue with religious leaders, parents, and other stakeholders to address concerns and build consensus.³⁴

Policy Reform and Implementation:

The government must ensure that policies like the Single National Curriculum are implemented effectively across the country.³⁵

This requires adequate funding, resources, and monitoring mechanisms to address disparities and ensure that all students have access to a balanced education.

Encouraging Research and Innovation:

Promoting research in the field of Islamic education can help develop innovative approaches to integrating religious and secular knowledge. Scholars and educators should work together to explore how Islamic principles can be applied to contemporary issues and subjects, fostering a curriculum that is both relevant and rooted in Islamic values.

Addressing Socio-Economic Disparities:

Should be made to bridge the socio-economic gaps that exist between students from different educational backgrounds.³⁶

Providing scholarships, improving infrastructure, and offering support services can help ensure that all students, regardless of their socio-economic status, have access to quality education that balances religious and secular knowledge.

Conclusion

This article explores the integration of religious and secular education within Pakistani schools from an Islamic perspective, emphasizing the need for a balanced approach where religious teachings and secular subjects complement each other. It begins by examining the historical evolution of educational practices in Pakistan and the role of Islamic education over time. Core principles of Islamic educational philosophy are discussed, highlighting the pursuit

of knowledge as a religious obligation and the importance of integrating both religious and worldly knowledge. The article addresses current challenges in balancing religious and secular curricula, such as issues related to curriculum design, teacher training, and societal expectations. Through case studies of Pakistani schools that have successfully implemented a balanced approach, it illustrates practical strategies and outcomes. Finally, the article offers recommendations for policymakers and educators to enhance the integration of religious and secular knowledge, ensuring a comprehensive and well-rounded education for students. The aim is to respect Islamic values while preparing students to meet contemporary academic and professional demands.

References

1. AMAN, Nazim. "Religion and Citizenship Education in Pakistan: The Case of Gilgit-Baltistan." PhD diss., Doctoral dissertation, University of Hong Kong, 2021.
2. Sunan Ibn Mājah, Kitāb al-Muqaddimah, Hadith 224.
3. ASHRAF, MUHAMMED. "CLASSIFICATION OF ISLAMIC SCIENCES."
4. Kamali, Mohammad Hashim. "Islam and sustainable development." *ICR Journal* 7, no. 1 (2016): 8-26.
5. Omar, Lazim, Abdullaah Jalil, Mohd Shaifulbahri Abdullah, Abdul Wahid Salleh, and Mohd Shahrizal Nasir. "Arabic For Special Purposes In The Context Of Management Studies." *Editors* (2017): 167.
6. Sahin, Abdullah. "Critical issues in Islamic education studies: Rethinking Islamic and Western liberal secular values of education." *Religions* 9, no. 11 (2018): 335.
7. Ariffin, Adlina Haji. "A Comparative Analysis of Ibn Sina and Al-Ghazali: Their Philosophical Underpinnings and Contributions toward Muslim Education." *PRICE: RM 35.00* (2011): 101.
8. Berkey, Jonathan P. "Madrasas medieval and modern: Politics, education, and the problem of Muslim identity." *Schooling Islam: The culture and politics of modern Muslim education* (2007): 40-60.
9. Fortna, Benjamin C. "Islamic morality in late Ottoman "secular" schools." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 32, no. 3 (2000): 369-393.
10. Fortna, Benjamin C. "Islamic morality in late Ottoman "secular" schools." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 32, no. 3 (2000): 369-393.
11. Sahin, Abdullah. "Critical issues in Islamic education studies: Rethinking Islamic and Western liberal secular values of education." *Religions* 9, no. 11 (2018): 335.
12. Durrani, Naureen, and Máiréad Dunne. "Curriculum and national identity: Exploring the links between religion and nation in Pakistan." *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 42, no. 2 (2010): 215-240.
13. Wolf, Patrick J., and Stephen Macedo, eds. *Educating citizens: International perspectives on civic values and school choice*. Brookings Institution Press, 2004.
14. Anzar, Uzma. "Islamic education: A brief history of madrassas with comments on curricula and current pedagogical practices." *Paper for the University of Vermont, Environmental Programme* 55 (2003).
15. Yasunaga, Mari. "Non-formal education as a means to meet learning needs of out-of-school children and adolescents." *Montreal: UNESCO Institute for Statistics* (2014).
16. Sathar, Zeba A., and Cynthia B. Lloyd. "Who gets primary schooling in Pakistan: Inequalities among and within families." *The Pakistan Development Review* (1994): 103-134.
17. Evans, Carolyn. "Religious education in public schools: An international human rights perspective." *Human Rights Law Review* 8, no. 3 (2008): 449-473.
18. Durrani, Naureen, Anjum Halai, Laila Kadiwal, Salima Karim Rajput, Mario Novelli, and Yusuf Sayed. "Education and social cohesion in Pakistan." *Project Report. UNICEF* (2017).
19. Bano, Masooda. "Madrasa reforms and Islamic modernism in Bangladesh." *Modern Asian Studies* 48,

no. 4 (2014): 911-939.

²⁰ . Kazeem, Aramide, Leif Jensen, and C. Shannon Stokes. "School attendance in Nigeria: Understanding the impact and intersection of gender, urban-rural residence, and socioeconomic status." *Comparative education review* 54, no. 2 (2010): 295-319.

²¹ . Qazi, Habib. "National identity in a postcolonial society: A foucauldian discourse analysis of Pakistan's national curriculum textbooks and their social practices in schools for shaping students' national belonging." PhD diss., University of Leicester, 2020.

²² . Nelson, Matthew J. "Religious education in non-religious schools: a comparative study of Pakistan and Bangladesh." *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics* 46, no. 3 (2008): 271-295.

²³ . Stambach, Amy. "Religion, education, and secularism in international agencies." *Comparative Education Review* 55, no. 1 (2011): 111-142.

²⁴ . Wahby, Muhab Medhat. "Re-Constructing the Zeal of Hamas."

²⁵ . Alberts, Wanda. *Integrative religious education in Europe: A study-of-religions approach*. Vol. 47. Walter de Gruyter, 2007.

²⁶ . Fair, C. Christine. *The madrassah challenge: Militancy and religious education in Pakistan*. Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press, 2008.

²⁷ . Nord, Warren A., and Charles C. Haynes. *Taking Religion Seriously Across the Curriculum: ASCD*. ASCD, 1998.

²⁸ . Sathar, Zeba A., and Cynthia B. Lloyd. "Who gets primary schooling in Pakistan: Inequalities among and within families." *The Pakistan Development Review* (1994): 103-134.

²⁹ . Gardner, Ryan S., Kate Soules, and John Valk. "The urgent need for teacher preparation in religious and secular worldview education." *Religious education* 112, no. 3 (2017): 242-254.

³⁰ . Müftügil, Ayşe Seda. "Compulsory religion education and religious minorities in Turkey." PhD diss., Universiteit van Amsterdam [Host], 2011.

³¹ . Malik, Sajjad Anwar, Muhammad Shabbir Ch, Zahira Batool, and Sadaf Mahmood. "Challenges and opportunities in implementation of single national curriculum: A qualitative inquiry." *Journal of ISOSS* 9, no. 1 (2023): 85-98.

³² . Bahroni, Imam. "The Principle of Integrated Islamic Education." *At-Ta'dib* 9, no. 1 (2014).

³³ . Byrne, Cathy. *Religion in secular education: What, in heaven's name, are we teaching our children?*. Vol. 21. Brill, 2014.

³⁴ . Byrne, Cathy. *Religion in secular education: What, in heaven's name, are we teaching our children?*. Vol. 21. Brill, 2014.

³⁵ . Ball, Stephen J., and Richard Bowe. "Subject departments and the 'implementation' of National Curriculum policy: an overview of the issues." *Journal of curriculum studies* 24, no. 2 (1992): 97-115.

³⁶ . Strand, Steve. "School effects and ethnic, gender and socio-economic gaps in educational achievement at age 11." *Oxford Review of Education* 40, no. 2 (2014): 223-245.